

# Mixing It Up: New Insights Into Interspecies Recombination Between Herpes Simplex Virus Type 1 and 2

D. Scott Schmid

Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, Division of Viral Diseases, Viral Vaccine Preventable Diseases Branch, Atlanta, Georgia

**Herpes simplex viruses (HSV-1 and HSV-2) are closely related alphaherpesviruses, with more than 80% identity at the deoxyribonucleic acid (DNA) sequence level [1]. More than two thirds of the world's population is estimated to have been infected with one or both viruses. The divergence of the common ancestor to these viruses is thought to have coincided with the separation of the human and chimpanzee lineages approximately 6 million years ago, leading to separate evolution of HSV-1 and HSV-2, respectively. Zoonotic transmission of HSV-2 to an extinct early hominid occurred approximately one and a half million years ago [2]. No other primate species are known to serve as common hosts for 2 distinct herpes simplex species.**

Recombination events between isolates of the same species have now been documented for all 9 herpesviruses for which humans are the natural host. This activity is currently understood to be one of the principal drivers of herpesvirus evolution and diversity [3]. For example, all of the circulating clades of varicella-zoster virus (VZV) are evidently mosaics of each other, arising from the recombinant interaction of distant ancestral viruses. Many VZV clinical samples have now been completely sequenced, and various stable clades display distinctive geographic distributions, with only a few genuinely single clade-specific sequences observed [4–6].

Knowledge that intertypic HSV-1 X HSV-2 recombinant viruses could be generated during in vitro coculture was established more than 40 years ago [7, 8]. However, the identification of naturally occurring intertypic recombinants was

reported only in the past few years [9, 10]. The common presence of these recombinant events in several specific open reading frames led to the conclusion that they were generated at some remote period in the past, and it seemed possible that such recombination events were no longer occurring. Such interspecies recombination has also been observed in 2 closely related betaherpesvirus species, human herpesvirus (HHV)-6A and HHV-6B, which can also coinfect humans [11].

In this issue of *the Journal of Infectious Diseases*, Casto et al evaluated approximately 500 complete HSV genome sequences, 255 of which were newly sequenced by the authors. In addition to the previously identified recombinants in UL29, UL30, and UL39, it was determined that both the sizes and locations of the recombination events were much more variable than previously appreciated. Two more remarkable events, each larger than 5 kilobase pairs and encompassing more than 1 open reading frame, were also identified. One of these occurred in a person with documented coinfection with HSV-1 and HSV-2; analysis of DNA sequence data from the 2 viruses indicated that the actual recombination event occurred in this study participant.

These results led the authors to reasonably conclude that interspecific HSV-1 × HSV-2 recombination is still occurring in dually infected persons. Moreover, as the authors note, the study likely underestimates the frequency of recombination events, because many of the viruses evaluated for the study were collected locally.

We were surprised to find that this phenomenon was unidirectional in nature; that is, no HSV-1 isolates were found to contain elements of HSV-2 DNA. There is no immediately apparent reason why this should be so, given that the 2 viruses share sufficient sequence identity to form HSV-2 viruses bearing HSV-1 sequence elements. This unidirectionality might be explained in several ways. For example, it has been shown that rates of genital shedding of HSV-1 are lower than for HSV-2 [12]. In addition, dual oral infection with HSV-1 and HSV-2 occurs less commonly than genital coinfection. It may also be a reflection of the relative history of HSV-1 versus HSV-2 in humans. Specifically, HSV-1 has coevolved with the human lineage for an estimated 6 million years. In contrast, HSV-2 is thought to have been first transmitted to humans only approximately 1.6 million years ago [2]. As such, HSV-1 strains may possess a higher degree of host-specific

Received 18 April 2019; editorial decision 18 April 2019; accepted 19 April 2019; published online April 23, 2019.

Correspondence: D. Scott Schmid, PhD, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, DVD, VVPDB, 1600 Clifton Rd, Bld 18, Rm 6-134, MS G-18 (dss1@cdc.gov).

**The Journal of Infectious Diseases**® 2019;XX(X):1–2  
 Published by Oxford University Press for the Infectious Diseases Society of America 2019. This work is written by (a) US Government employee(s) and is in the public domain in the US.  
 DOI: 10.1093/infdis/jiz200

selective fitness than HSV-1× HSV-2 recombinants.

This phenomenon raises concerns that the use of a live-attenuated HSV-2 vaccine in areas where HSV-1 prevalence is high could result in interspecific recombinant viruses with enhanced pathogenicity. Genital infections with HSV-1 are increasing in prevalence, which could result in an increased frequency of HSV-1 × HSV-2 recombination [13, 14].

These fascinating new insights into the dynamic interaction between 2 common HHV infections provide fresh concepts into how these complex viruses can maximize variation and thus continue their eons-old balance of power with their hosts. The larger scale, more geographically encompassing studies proposed by the authors promise to greatly expand our current knowledge about the evolution and generation of diversity in these viruses.

#### Note

**Disclaimer.** The findings and conclusions in this report are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the official position of the Centers for Diseases Control and Prevention.

**Potential conflicts of interest.** The author: No reported conflicts of interest. The author has submitted the ICMJE Form for Disclosure of Potential Conflicts of Interest.

#### References

1. Roizman B, Knipe DM, Whitley RJ. Herpes simplex viruses. In: Knipe DM, Howley PM, eds, *Field's virology*, 6th ed, Philadelphia, PA: Lippincott Williams and Wilkins, 2013: pp 1828.
2. Wertheim JO, Smith MD, Smith DM, Scheffler K, Kosakovsky Pond SL. Evolutionary origins of human herpes simplex viruses 1 and 2. *Mol Biol Evol* 2014; 31:2356–64.
3. Renner DW, Szpara ML. Impacts of genome-wide analyses on our understanding of human herpesvirus diversity and evolution. *J Virol* 2018; 92:e00908–17.
4. Loparev VN, Rubtcova EN, Bostik V, et al. Identification of five major and two minor genotypes of varicella-zoster virus strains: a practical two-amplicon approach used to genotype clinical isolates in Australia and New Zealand. *J Virol* 2007; 81:12758–65.
5. Loparev VN, Rubtcova EN, Bostik V, et al. Distribution of varicella-zoster virus (VZV) wild-type genotypes in northern and southern Europe: evidence for high conservation of circulating genotypes. *Virology* 2009; 383:216–25.
6. Jensen NJ, Rivaille P, Tseng HF, et al. Revisiting the genotyping scheme for varicella-zoster viruses based on whole-genome comparisons. *J Gen Virol* 2017; 98:1434–8.
7. Morse LS, Buchman TG, Roizman B, Schaffer PA. Anatomy of herpes simplex virus DNA. IX. Apparent exclusion of some parental DNA arrangements in the generation of intertypic (HSV-1 × HSV-2) recombinants. *J Virol* 1977; 24:231–48.
8. Davison AJ, Wilkie NM. Inversion of the two segments of the herpes simplex virus genome in intertypic recombinants. *J Gen Virol* 1983; 64 (Pt 1):1–18.
9. Burrell S, Boutolleau D, Ryu D, et al. Ancient recombination events between human herpes simplex viruses. *Mol Biol Evol* 2017; 34:1713–21.
10. Koelle DM, Norberg P, Fitzgibbon MP, et al. Worldwide circulation of HSV-2 × HSV-1 recombinant strains. *Sci Rep* 2017; 7:44084.
11. Greninger AL, Roychoudhury P, Makhsous N, et al. Copy number heterogeneity, large origin tandem repeats, and interspecies recombination in human herpesvirus 6A and (HHV-6A) and HHV-6B reference strains. *J Virol* 2018; 92:e00135–18.
12. Peña KC, Adelson MG, Mordechai E, Blaho J. Genital herpes simplex virus type 1 in women: detection in cervicovaginal specimens from gynecological practices in the United States. *J Clin Micro* 2010; 48:150–3.
13. Gilbert M, Li X, Petric M, et al. Using centralized laboratory data to monitor trends in herpes simplex virus type 1 and 2 infection in British Columbia and the changing etiology of genital herpes. *Can J Public Health* 2011; 102:225–9.
14. Ryder N, Jin F, McNulty AM, Grulich AE, Donovan B. Increasing role of herpes simplex virus type 1 in first-episode anogenital herpes in heterosexual women and younger men who have sex with men, 1992–2006. *Sex Transm Infect* 2009; 85:416–9.